

## FEB 1 4 2005

#### **BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD**

STATE OF ILLINOIS Pollution Control Board

**GINA PATTERMANN** 

Complainant,

PCB 99-187

V.

(Citizen Enforcement, Noise & Air)

BOUGHTON TRUCKING AND MATERIALS, INC.

Respondent.

#### NOTICE OF FILING

To: See Attached Certificate of Service

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that on the 11<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2005, the undersigned caused to be filed with the Office of the Clerk of the Pollution Control Board the COMPLAINANT'S RESPONSE TO RESPONDENT'S MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE INSTANTER, a copy of which is herewith served upon you.

THE JEFF DIVER GROUP, L.L.C.

By:

Michael S. Blazer THE JEFF DIVER GROUP, L.L.C. 1749 S. Naperville Road, Suite #102 Wheaton, IL 60187 (630) 681-2530

# CLERK'S OFFICE

#### BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

FEB 1 4 2005

STATE OF ILLINOIS Pollution Control Board

GINA PATTERMANN

۷.

Complainant,

PCB 99-187

BOUGHTON TRUCKING AND MATERIALS, INC.

(Citizen Enforcement, Noise & Air)

Respondent.

#### COMPLAINANT'S RESPONSE TO RESPONDENT'S MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE SUPPLEMENTAL RESPONSE TO MOTION FOR VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL

Now comes Complainant, Gina Pattermann ("Pattermann"), by her attorneys, and for her Response to the Motion of Respondent, Boughton Trucking and Materials, Inc. ("Boughton") for Leave to File a Supplemental Response Instanter, states:

1. Had Boughton truly wished to merely add one invoice to its prior Response, the simple expedient of tendering an additional exhibit would have sufficed. Boughton's current filing goes much farther and reflects a transparent attempt to further assert its improper effort to recover "costs" to which Boughton is not entitled.

2. As things now stand, there is pending before this Board Pattermann's Motion for Leave to file a Reply Memorandum, in large part to fully address Boughton's improper claims for "costs".<sup>1</sup> As indicated in that pending Motion, Pattermann's counsel provided Boughton's counsel with the case citations that identify the costs to which Boughton would be entitled in the context of Pattermann's Motion for Voluntary Dismissal. A copy of counsel's e-mail of January 23, 2005 is attached hereto as Exhibit

As originally filed, the subject Motion also sought an expedited ruling by this Board regarding the pending Motion for Voluntary Dismissal, because of the pendency of the scheduled hearing in this matter. The Hearing Officer has since cancelled that hearing, leaving the request to file a Reply Memorandum as the primary object of the Motion.

A. More important, the subject e-mail pointed out cases confirming the costs to which Boughton is <u>not</u> entitled.

3. Despite the foregoing, Boughton persists in its pursuit of its excessive costs. Its effort is wholly inappropriate and finds no support in the Board's rules. Under the circumstances, Boughton's Motion for Leave to File Instanter should be denied.

Respectfully submitted,

Gina Pattermann

By:

One of her attorneys

Michael S. Blazer The Jeff Diver Group, L.L.C. 1749 S. Naperville Road Suite 102 Wheaton, IL 60187 630-681-2530

### Michael S. Blazer

From: Michael S. Blazer [mblazer@enviroatty.com]

Sent: Sunday, January 23, 2005 1:48 PM

To: Sharkey, Patricia F.

Subject: RE: Pattermann v. Boughton; Respondent's Costs

Pat:

I have had a chance to review your list of "costs". In the context of a Voluntary Dismissal, I am unable to find any support for the award of the items you seek in either Section 2-1009 or Supreme Court Rules 208 and 219. First, the case law is clear that attorneys' fees and expenses, including travel expenses and the like, are not recoverable. See *Gilbert-Hodgman, Inc. v. Chicago Thoroughbred Enterprises, Inc.,* 17 III.App.3d 460 (1st Dist. 1974). Likewise, in this context, expert witness and deposition fees and expenses are not recoverable. See *Vicencio v. Lincoln-Way Builders, Inc.,* 204 III.2d 295 (2003); *Galowich v. Beech Aircraft Corporation,* 92 III.2d 157 (1982). Any reliance you may be placing on Supreme Court Rule 219(e) in this regard is misplaced, as that provision applies only to circumstances evidencing sanctionable conduct. See *Morrison v. Wagner,* 191 III.2d 162 (2000); *Scattered Corp. v. Midwest Clearing Corp.,* 299 III.App.3d 653 (1st Dist. 1998).

I note that the costs that <u>are</u> allowed in this context, filing fees and the like, are absent from your correspondence. In any event, as set forth in our Motion, we remain ready to pay appropriate costs upon presentation of the same. I do not, however, wish to foreclose you from substantiating your position, and I would welcome citations to any authorities that are contrary to or have overruled that set forth above.

Mike

Michael S. Blazer Principal The Jeff Diver Group, L.L.C. 1749 S. Naperville Road Suite 102 Wheaton, IL 60187 (630) 681-2530 Fax: (630) 690-2812 Mobil: (708) 404-9091 mblazer@enviroatty.com

This e-mail is covered by the Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 U.S.C. §§ 2510-2521 and is legally privileged, including any attachments, contains information that is confidential, may be protected by the attorney/client or other applicable privileges, and may constitute non-public information. This message is intended to be conveyed only to the designated recipient(s). If you are not the intended recipient of this message, please immediately notify the sender that you have received this message in error and delete this message. Unauthorized use, disclosure, dissemination, distribution or reproduction of this message or the information contained in this message or the taking of any action in reliance on it is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. Thank you for your cooperation.

-----Original Message-----

From: Sharkey, Patricia F. [mailto:PSharkey@mayerbrownrowe.com]
Sent: Friday, January 21, 2005 5:30 PM
To: Michael S. Blazer
Cc: Desharnais, Kevin; Gale, Michelle A.; Ter Molen, Mark R.
Subject: Pattermann v. Boughton; Respondent's Costs

Mike - As discussed on the phone this afternoon, I am attaching a letter with a preliminary statement of Boughton's "costs" within the meaning of Section 5/2-1009 and invoices. We have limited this to costs which are expressly authorized under the Code and Supreme Court Rule 208 and 219. I don't have the Kip Smith invoice in hand right now, but can obtain it Monday. Have a good weekend. -Pat

<<Boughton.PDF>> <<Letter.PDF>>

Patricia F. Sharkey Mayer, Brown, Rowe & Maw LLP 190 South LaSalle Street Chicago, Illinois 60603 312-701-7952 psharkey@mayerbrownrowe.com

This email and any files transmitted with it are confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this email in error please notify the system manager. This message contains confidential information and is intended only for the individual named. If you are not the named addressee you should not disseminate, distribute or copy this e-mail. This email and any files transmitted with it are confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this email in error please notify the system manager. This message contains confidential information and is intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this email in error please notify the system manager. This message contains confidential information and is intended only for the individual named. If you are not the named addressee you should not disseminate, distribute or copy this e-mail.

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that he caused the above and foregoing Notice of Filing and MEMORANDUM IN RESPONSE TO RESPONDENT'S MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE INSTANTER, all on behalf of the Complainant, to be served via facsimile transmission upon the following:

Bradley P. Halloran Illinois Pollution Control Board James R. Thompson Center 100 West Randolph Street Suite 11-500 Chicago, IL 60601 Fax No. (312) 814-3669 Patricia F. Sharkey Kevin G. Deshamais Mayer, Brown, Rowe & Maw 190 S. LaSalle Street Chicago, IL 60603 Fax No. (312) 706-9113

on this 11<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2005.

THE JEFF DIVER GROUP, L.L.C.

By:

Michael S. Blazer